



**APPROACHES TO ENVIRONMENTAL RESOURCES  
463HF**

**Course Materials  
2001-2002**

**VOLUME TWO OF TWO**

**Instructor: Katrina M. Wyman**

**Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the Faculty of Law,  
University of Toronto.**

**Storage**

**K  
3478  
.A58W96  
2001  
v.2  
c.1**

BORA LASKIN LIBRARY

SEP - 4 2001

THE TRUST OF UOIT

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**APPROACHES TO ENVIRONMENTAL RESOURCES  
463HF**

**Course Materials  
2001-2002**

**VOLUME TWO OF TWO**

**Instructor: Katrina M. Wyman**

**Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students in the Faculty of Law,  
University of Toronto.**



## APPROACHES TO ENVIRONMENTAL RESOURCES

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### VOLUME ONE OF TWO

<b>1. Defining the Issue(s) in Managing Environmental Resources .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1 Examples</b>	
T. Walkom, "Lax Rules Won't Stop This Manure" <i>The Toronto Star</i> (26 June 2001) A19 .....	2
J. Tierney, "A Tale of Two Fisheries" <i>The New York Times Magazine</i> (27 August 2000) 38 .....	4
G. York, "Russian City Ravaging Arctic Land" <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (25 July 2001) 13	
<b>1.2 Economic approaches</b>	
G. Hardin, "The Tragedy of the Commons" (1968) 162 <i>Science</i> 1243 .....	15
H. Scott Gordon, "The Economic Theory of a Common-Property Resource: The Fishery" (1954) 62 <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> 124 .....	21
M. Olson, <i>The Logic of Collective Action: Public Goods and the Theory of Groups</i> (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1965) .....	33
E. Ostrom, <i>Governing the Commons: The Evolution of Institutions for Collective Action</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990) .....	35
<b>1.3 Non-economic approaches</b>	
Introduction, R.L. Revesz, <i>Foundations of Environmental Law and Policy</i> (New York: Foundation Press, 1997) 19 .....	40
M. Sagoff, <i>The Economy of the Earth: Philosophy, Law, and the Environment</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988) in R.L. Revesz, <i>Foundations of Environmental Law and Policy</i> (New York: Foundation Press, 1997) 21 .....	41
P.W. Taylor, <i>Respect for Nature: A Theory of Environmental Ethics</i> (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986) in R.L. Revesz, <i>Foundations of Environmental Law and Policy</i> (New York: Foundation Press, 1997) 32 .....	47
<b>2. Establishing the Goals for Resource Management .....</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>2.1 Possibly contrasting approaches?</b>	
J. Ibbetson, "Clean-Air Measures Have the Smell of Taxation" <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (27 March 2001) .....	54
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Office of Water, Fact Sheet: Drinking Water Standard for Arsenic (January 2001), online: < <a href="http://www.epa.gov/safewater/ars/ars_rule_factsheet.html">http://www.epa.gov/safewater/ars/ars_rule_factsheet.html</a> > .....	56

D. Jehl, "House Demanding Strict Guidelines on Arsenic Levels" <i>The New York Times</i> (28 July 2001) .....	59
<b>2.2 Decision frameworks</b>	
L.B. Lave, "The Strategy of Social Regulation: Decision Frameworks for Policy" (Brookings Institution, 1981) in R.L. Revesz, <i>Foundations of Environmental Law and Policy</i> (New York: Foundation Press, 1997) 94 .....	61
K. Arrow et al., "Is There a Role for Benefit-Cost Analysis in Environmental, Health, and Safety Regulation?" (1996) 272 <i>Science</i> 221 .....	67
C. Sunstein, "Is Cost-Benefit Analysis For Everyone?" (2001) 53 <i>Administrative Law Review</i> 299 .....	69
S. Kelman, "Cost-Benefit Analysis: An Ethical Critique (with replies)" (1981) AEI <i>Journal on Government and Society Regulation</i> 33 .....	78
<i>114957 Canada Ltée (Spraytech, Société d'arrosage) v. Hudson (Town)</i> , 2001 SCC 40 .....	87
<b>3. Environmental Policy Instruments: Increasingly Complex Forms of Property Rights? 94</b>	
<b>3.1 Classic theory</b>	
H. Demsetz, "Toward a Theory of Property Rights" (1967) 57 <i>Am. Econ. Rev.</i> 347 95	
Note 9 from J. Dukeminier & J.E. Krier, <i>Property</i> , 4th ed. (Aspen Publishers, Inc., 1998) .....	108
<b>3.2 Application to environmental law</b>	
C.M. Rose, "Rethinking Environmental Controls: Management Strategies for Common Resources" (1991) 40 <i>Duke L.J.</i> 1 .....	110
<b>3.3 Wildlife law</b>	
C. Kirby, "The English Game Law System" (1933) 38 <i>Am. Hist. Rev.</i> 240 .....	148
D. Lueck, "The Economic Nature of Wildlife Law" (1989) 18 <i>Journal of Legal Studies</i> 291 .....	156
<b>4. Air Pollution .....</b>	174
<b>4.1 Tradeable rights</b>	
J.H. Dales, <i>Pollution, Property &amp; Prices</i> (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1968) .....	175
B.A. Ackerman & R.B. Stewart, "Reforming Environmental Law: The Democratic Case for Market Incentives" (1988) 13 <i>Columbia Journal of Environmental Law</i> 171 .....	188

4.2	<i>U.S. experience</i>	
	National Center for Environmental Economics, Office of Policy, Economics, and Innovation, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, <i>The United States Experience with Economic Incentives for Protecting the Environment</i> (2001) .....	203
4.3	<i>Ontario</i>	
	Ontario Ministry of the Environment, Environmental Registry Posting dated July 31, 2001 .....	210
	Ontario Ministry of the Environment, Technical Description: Emissions Trading and NO <sub>x</sub> and SO <sub>2</sub> Limits for the Electricity Sector .....	213
4.4	<i>Climate Change</i>	
	A.C. Revkin, "178 Nations Reach Climate Accord; U.S. Only Looks On" <i>The New York Times</i> (24 July 2001) .....	219
	H. Scoffield, "Experts See Spending Rise For Clean Air" <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (30 July 2001) .....	222
	Government of Canada, Canada and the Kyoto Protocol: The Kyoto Mechanisms, online: < <a href="http://climatechange.gc.ca/english/whats_new/kyoto_e.html">http://climatechange.gc.ca/english/whats_new/kyoto_e.html</a> > .....	224
	Government of Canada, National Climate Change Process, Tradeable Permits Working Group, <i>Using Tradeable Emissions Permits To Help Achieve Domestic Greenhouse Gas Objectives: Options Report</i> (2000) .....	226
5.	<b>Water</b> .....	246
5.1	<i>Regulating water quality</i>	
	S. Shavell, "Liability for Harm Versus Regulation of Safety" (1984) 13 <i>Journal of Legal Studies</i> 357 .....	247
	T.L. Anderson & D.R. Leal, <i>Free Market Environmentalism</i> , rev. ed. (New York: Palgrave, 2001) .....	253
	E. Brubaker, <i>Property Rights in the Defence of Nature</i> (Toronto: Earthscan, 1995) .....	257
	Submissions of the Concerned Walkerton Citizens and Canadian Environmental Law Association to Part II of the Walkerton Inquiry, Tragedy on Tap: Why Ontario Needs a Safe Drinking Water Act (15 May 2001) .....	264
5.2	<i>Agricultural pollution</i>	
	Environmental Commissioner of Ontario, <i>The Protection of Ontario's Groundwater and Intensive Farming: Special Report to the Legislative Assembly of Ontario</i> (27 July 2000) 9-11 .....	268

N. d'Ombrain, Machinery of Government for Safe Drinking Water in Ontario (Background Document for the Walkerton Inquiry) (30 March 2001) 48-49	271
Ontario Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs, "New Ontario Legislation Will Protect Water and Set Clear Standards for Farms" <i>News Release</i> (13 June 2001)	273
J.B. Ruhl, "Farms, Their Environmental Harms, and Environmental Law" (2000) 27 <i>Ecology L.Q.</i> 263	277
M. Goss et al., The Management of Manure in Ontario with Respect to Water Quality (Background Document for the Walkerton Inquiry) (6 March 2001) 43-45	283
<b>5.3 <i>Privatization of water systems</i></b>	
N. d'Ombrain, Machinery of Government for Safe Drinking Water in Ontario (Background Document for the Walkerton Inquiry) (30 March 2001) 7-15, 40-44	286
E. Brubaker on behalf of Energy Probe Research Foundation, The Promise of Privatization (Prepared for the Walkerton Inquiry) (April 2001) 1-3	300
The Canadian Environmental Law Association, The Canadian Union of Public Employees & The Ontario Public Service Employees Union, Water Services in Ontario: For the Public, By the Public, A Submission to Phase 2 of the Walkerton Inquiry (22 June 2001) 35-46	303
D. Cameron, The Relationship Between Different Ownership and Management Regimes and Drinking Water Safety: A Discussion Paper for the Walkerton Inquiry (June 2001, as amended 4 July 2001) 3-4, 37-41, 50-64	315
<b>5.4 <i>Water trading or pricing</i></b>	
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, <i>Economic Surveys – Canada</i> , Chapter IV: Making Growth More Environmentally Sustainable, Water Supply: A Common Good (2000)	337
<b>VOLUME TWO OF TWO</b>	
<b>6. Fisheries</b>	345
<b>6.1 <i>Traditional forms of regulation</i></b>	
Review H. Scott Gordon, "The Economic Theory of a Common-Property Resource: The Fishery" (1954) 62 <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> 124	21
D.P. Dupont, "Limited Entry Fishing Programs: Theory and Canadian Practice" in D.V. Gordon & G.R. Munro, eds., <i>Fisheries and Uncertainty: A Precautionary Approach to Resource Management</i> (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1996) 107	346

6.2	<i>Individual transferable quotas</i>	
	R.Q. Grafton, "Individual Transferable Quotas and Canada's Atlantic Fisheries" in D.V. Gordon & G.R. Munro, eds., <i>Fisheries and Uncertainty: A Precautionary Approach to Resource Management</i> (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1996) 129	356
	D.L. Burke & G.L. Brander, "Canadian Experience with Individual Transferable Quotas" (1999) . . . . .	368
	<i>Carpenter Fishing Corp. v. Canada</i> (1998), 155 D.L.R. (4th) 572 (F.C.A.) . . . . .	381
6.3	<i>Aboriginal and treaty rights</i>	
	<i>R. v. Gladstone</i> , [1996] 2 S.C.R. 723 . . . . .	389
	<i>R. v. Marshall</i> , [1999] 3 S.C.R. 456 . . . . .	398
	<i>R. v. Marshall</i> , [1999] 3 S.C.R. 533 . . . . .	402
	<i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> , [1997] 3 S.C.R. 1010 . . . . .	412
7.	<b>Common Property Approaches</b>	433
7.1	<i>Categorizing and explaining common property approaches</i>	
	C.M. Rose, "Expanding the Choices for the Global Commons: Comparing Newfangled Tradable Allowance Schemes to Old-Fashioned Common Property Regimes" (1999) 10 Duke Envtl. L. & Pol'y F. 45 . . . . .	434
	P. Bardhan, "Symposium on Management of Local Commons" (1993) 7 Journal of Economic Perspectives 87 . . . . .	451
7.2	<i>Examples</i>	
	F. Berkes, "Indigenous Knowledge and Resource Management Systems: A Native Canadian Case Study from James Bay" in S. Hanna & M. Munasinghe, eds., <i>Property Rights in a Social and Ecological Context: Case Studies and Design Applications</i> (Washington, D.C.: Beijer International Institute of Ecological Economics and the World Bank, 1995) 99 . . . . .	457
	W.K. Stevens, "Biologists Fear Sustainable Yield Is Unsustainable Idea" <i>The New York Times</i> (20 April 1993) C4 . . . . .	468
	G. Monbiot, "The Tragedy of Enclosure" in D. VanDeVeer & C. Pierce, eds., <i>The Environmental Ethics and Policy Book</i> , 2d ed. (Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing Company, 1998) 360 . . . . .	470
	F.G. Peacock & J. Hansen, "Community Management in Groundfish: A New Approach to Property Rights" (1999) . . . . .	473

<b>8. Transitions .....</b>	<b>482</b>
8.1 <i>Conceptualizing the impediments</i>	
J. Krier, "The Tragedy of the Commons, Part Two" (1991) 15 Harvard Journal of Law & Public Policy 331 .....	483
G.D. Libecap, <i>Contracting for Property Rights</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989) .....	495
J.L. Knetsch, "The Endowment Effect and Evidence of Nonreversible Indifference Curves" (1989) 79 Am. Econ. Rev. 1277 .....	505
8.2 <i>Takings: relevant in the Canadian context?</i>	
<i>The Queen v. Tener</i> (1985), 17 D.L.R. (4th) 1 (S.C.C.) .....	512
Supplementary reading on the implications of NAFTA to follow	
H.A. Span, Of TEAs and Takings: Compensation Guarantees for Confiscated Tradeable Environmental Allowances (2000) 109 Yale L.J. 1983 .....	526
<b>9. Obstacles to Reform in Canada? .....</b>	<b>545</b>
9.1 <i>Wealth maximization and distributional theories</i>	
T.W. Merrill, "Innovations in Environmental Policy: Explaining Market Mechanisms" (2000) U. Ill. L. Rev. 275 .....	546
D.N. Dewees, "Instrument Choice in Environmental Policy" (1983) 9 Economic Inquiry 53 .....	565
9.2 <i>Political institutions?</i>	
T.M. Moe & M. Caldwell, "The Institutional Foundations of Democratic Government: A Comparison of Presidential and Parliamentary Systems" (1994) 150 Journal of Institutional and Theoretical Economics 171 .....	568
D. Dewees, <i>Reducing the Burden of Environmental Regulation</i> (Kingston: Government and Competitiveness, School of Policy Studies, Queen's University, 1993) .....	581
9.3 <i>Traditional regulatory approach?</i>	
T. Conway, "Taking Stock of the Traditional Regulatory Approach" in G. Bruce Doern, ed., <i>Getting It Green: Case Studies in Canadian Environmental Regulation</i> (Toronto and Calgary: C.D. Howe Institute, 1990) 25 .....	583
9.4 <i>Case study</i>	
B.J. McCay, "Individual Transferable Quotas (ITQs) in Canadian and US Fisheries" (1996) 28 Ocean & Coastal Management 85 .....	599

<b>10. Ethics and Environmental Regulation .....</b>	<b>624</b>
L.J. Strahilevitz, "How Changes in Property Regimes Influence Social Norms: Commodifying California's Carpool Lanes" (2000) 75 Indiana Law Journal 1231 .....	625
M. Potter, "Despite Smog, Carpools Are Falling From Favour" <i>The Toronto Star</i> (18 June 2001) .....	657
Review M. Sagoff, <i>The Economy of the Earth: Philosophy, Law, and the Environment</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988) in R.L. Revesz, <i>Foundations of Environmental Law and Policy</i> (New York: Foundation Press, 1997) 21 .....	41
C.M. Rose, "Environmental Faust Succumbs to Temptations of Economic Mephistopheles, or, Value by Any Other Name is Preference" (1989) 87 Michigan Law Review 1631 .....	660

